

27 NCAC 01B .0113 PROCEEDINGS BEFORE THE GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE

- (a) Probable Cause - The Grievance Committee or any of its subcommittees acting as the Grievance Committee with respect to grievances referred to it by the chair of the Grievance Committee will determine whether there is probable cause to believe that a respondent committed misconduct justifying disciplinary action. In its discretion, the Grievance Committee or a panel thereof may find probable cause regardless of whether the respondent has been served with a written letter of notice. The respondent may waive the necessity of a finding of probable cause with the consent of the counsel and the chair of the Grievance Committee. A decision of a panel of the committee may not be appealed to the Grievance Committee as a whole or to another panel (except as provided in 27 N.C.A.C. 1A, .0701(a)(3)).
- (b) Oaths and Affirmations - The chair of the Grievance Committee will have the power to administer oaths and affirmations.
- (c) Record of Grievance Committee's Determination - The chair will keep a record of the Grievance Committee's determination concerning each grievance and file the record with the secretary.
- (d) Closed Meetings - The counsel and deputy counsel, the witness under examination, interpreters when needed, and, if deemed necessary, a stenographer or operator of a recording device may be present while the committee is in session and deliberating, but no persons other than members may be present while the committee is voting.
- (e) Procedure When Counsel Recommends Admonition, Reprimand, Censure, or Referral to the Disciplinary Hearing Commission. If the counsel recommends admonition, reprimand, censure, or referral to the Disciplinary Hearing Commission,
- (1) At least 30 days before the committee's consideration of the counsel's recommendation, the counsel shall provide to the respondent:
 - (A) all financial audits and all other materials provided to the committee that are not privileged and are not work product; and
 - (B) any evidence in the possession of the State Bar that indicates the respondent did not engage in the alleged misconduct, or a certification that no such evidence is in the State Bar's possession.
 - (2) The respondent shall have the opportunity to hear the counsel's presentation of the factual basis for the recommendation and to address the subcommittee to which the grievance is assigned. The chair of the Grievance Committee shall have discretion to offer respondents the option of participating via video conference and to determine the amount of time the counsel and the respondent will have to address the subcommittee, ensuring the respondent is allowed at least the same amount of time as is granted to the counsel for its recitation of factual basis.
- (f) Disclosure of Matters Before the Grievance Committee - The results of any deliberation by the Grievance Committee will be disclosed to the counsel and the secretary for use in the performance of their duties. Otherwise, a member of the committee, the staff of the North Carolina State Bar, any interpreter, stenographer, operator of a recording device, or any typist who transcribes recorded testimony may disclose matters occurring before the committee only when so directed by the committee or a court of record.
- (g) Quorum Requirement - At any preliminary hearing held by the Grievance Committee, a quorum of one-half of the members will be required to conduct any business. Affirmative vote of a majority of members present will be necessary to find that probable cause exists. The chair will not be counted for quorum purposes and will be eligible to vote regarding the disposition of any grievance only in case of a tie among the regular voting members.
- (h) Results of Grievance Committee Deliberations - If probable cause is found and the committee determines that a hearing is necessary, the chair will direct the counsel to prepare and file a complaint against the respondent. If the committee finds probable cause but determines that no hearing is necessary, it will direct the counsel to prepare for the chair's signature an admonition, reprimand, or censure. If no probable cause is found, the grievance will be dismissed or dismissed with a letter of warning or a letter of caution.
- (i) Letters of Caution - If no probable cause is found but it is determined by the Grievance Committee that the conduct of the respondent is unprofessional or not in accord with accepted professional practice, the committee may issue a letter of caution to the respondent recommending that the respondent be more professional in his or her practice in one or more ways which are to be specifically identified.
- (j) Letters of Warning
- (1) If no probable cause is found but it is determined by the Grievance Committee that the conduct of the respondent is an unintentional, minor, or technical violation of the Rules of Professional Conduct, the committee may issue a letter of warning to the respondent. The letter of warning will advise the respondent that he or she may be subject to discipline if such conduct is continued or

repeated. The letter will specify in one or more ways the conduct or practice for which the respondent is being warned. The letter of warning will not constitute discipline of the respondent.

- (2) A copy of the letter of warning will be maintained in the office of the counsel for three years. If relevant, a copy of the letter of warning may be offered into evidence in any proceeding filed against the respondent before the commission within three years after the letter of warning is issued to the respondent. In every case filed against the respondent before the commission within three years after the letter of warning is issued to the respondent, the letter of warning may be introduced into evidence as an aggravating factor concerning the issue of what disciplinary sanction should be imposed. A copy of the letter of warning may be disclosed to the Grievance Committee if another grievance is filed against the respondent within three years after the letter of warning is issued to the respondent.
 - (3) Service of Process:
 - (A) If valid service upon the respondent has previously been accomplished by certified mail, personal service, publication, or acceptance of service by the respondent or the respondent's counsel, a copy of the letter of warning may be served upon the respondent by mailing a copy of the letter of warning to the respondent's last known address on file with the State Bar. Service shall be deemed complete upon deposit of the letter of warning in a postpaid, properly addressed wrapper in a post office or official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service.
 - (B) If valid service upon the respondent has not previously been accomplished by certified mail, personal service, publication, or acceptance of service by the respondent or the respondent's counsel, a copy of the letter of warning shall be served upon the respondent by certified mail or personal service. If diligent efforts to serve the respondent by certified mail and by personal service are unsuccessful, the letter of warning shall be served by mailing a copy of the letter of warning to the respondent's last known address on file with the State Bar. Service shall be deemed complete upon deposit of the letter of warning in a postpaid, properly addressed wrapper in a post office or official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service.
 - (4) Within 15 days after service, the respondent may refuse the letter of warning and request a hearing before the commission to determine whether the respondent violated the Rules of Professional Conduct. Such refusal and request will be in writing, addressed to the Grievance Committee, and served on the secretary by certified mail, return receipt requested. The refusal will state that the letter of warning is refused. If the respondent does not serve a refusal and request within 15 days after service upon the respondent of the letter of warning, the letter of warning will be deemed accepted by the respondent. An extension of time may be granted by the chairperson of the Grievance Committee for good cause shown.
 - (5) In cases in which the respondent refuses the letter of warning, the counsel will prepare and file a complaint against the respondent at the commission.
- (k) Admonitions, Reprimands, and Censures
- (1) If probable cause is found but it is determined by the Grievance Committee that a complaint and hearing are not warranted, the committee shall issue an admonition in cases in which the respondent has committed a minor violation of the Rules of Professional Conduct, a reprimand in cases in which the respondent's conduct has violated one or more provisions of the Rules of Professional Conduct and caused harm or potential harm to a client, the administration of justice, the profession, or members of the public, or a censure in cases in which the respondent has violated one or more provisions of the Rules of Professional Conduct and the harm or potential harm caused by the respondent is significant and protection of the public requires more serious discipline. To determine whether more serious discipline is necessary to protect the public or whether the violation is minor and less serious discipline is sufficient to protect the public, the committee shall consider the factors delineated in subparagraphs (2) and (3) below.
 - (2) Factors that shall be considered in determining whether protection of the public requires a censure include, but are not limited to, the following:
 - (A) prior discipline for the same or similar conduct;
 - (B) prior notification by the North Carolina State Bar of the wrongfulness of the conduct;
 - (C) refusal to acknowledge wrongful nature of conduct;
 - (D) lack of indication of reformation;

- (E) likelihood of repetition of misconduct;
 - (F) uncooperative attitude toward disciplinary process;
 - (G) pattern of similar conduct;
 - (H) violation of the Rules of Professional Conduct in more than one unrelated matter;
 - (I) lack of efforts to rectify consequences of conduct;
 - (J) imposition of lesser discipline would fail to acknowledge the seriousness of the misconduct and would send the wrong message to members of the Bar and the public regarding the conduct expected of members of the Bar;
 - (K) notification contemporaneous with the conduct at issue of the wrongful nature of the conduct and failure to take remedial action.
- (3) Factors that shall be considered in determining whether the violation of the Rules is minor and warrants issuance of an admonition include, but are not limited to, the following:
- (A) lack of prior discipline for same or similar conduct;
 - (B) recognition of wrongful nature of conduct;
 - (C) indication of reformation;
 - (D) indication that repetition of misconduct not likely;
 - (E) isolated incident;
 - (F) violation of the Rules of Professional Conduct in only one matter;
 - (G) lack of harm or potential harm to client, administration of justice, profession, or members of the public;
 - (H) efforts to rectify consequences of conduct;
 - (I) inexperience in the practice of law;
 - (J) imposition of admonition appropriately acknowledges the minor nature of the violation(s) of the Rules of Professional Conduct;
 - (K) notification contemporaneous with the conduct at issue of the wrongful nature of the conduct resulting in efforts to take remedial action;
 - (L) personal or emotional problems contributing to the conduct at issue;
 - (M) successful participation in and completion of contract with Lawyer's Assistance Program where mental health or substance abuse issues contributed to the conduct at issue.
- (l) Procedures for Admonitions, Reprimands, and Censures
- (1) A record of any admonition, reprimand, or censure issued by the Grievance Committee will be maintained in the office of the secretary.
 - (2)
 - (A) If valid service upon the respondent has previously been accomplished by certified mail, personal service, publication, or acceptance of service by the respondent or the respondent's counsel, a copy of the admonition, reprimand, or censure may be served upon the respondent by mailing a copy of the admonition, reprimand, or censure to the respondent's last known address on file with the State Bar. Service shall be deemed complete upon deposit of the admonition, reprimand, or censure in a postpaid, properly addressed wrapper in a post office or official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service.
 - (B) If valid service upon the respondent has not previously been accomplished by certified mail, personal service, publication, or acceptance of service by the respondent or the respondent's counsel, a copy of the admonition, reprimand, or censure shall be served upon the respondent by certified mail or personal service. If diligent efforts to serve the respondent by certified mail and by personal service are unsuccessful, the respondent shall be served by mailing a copy of the admonition, reprimand, or censure to the respondent's last known address on file with the State Bar. Service shall be deemed complete upon deposit of the admonition, reprimand, or censure in a postpaid, properly addressed wrapper in a post office or official depository under the exclusive care and custody of the United States Postal Service.
 - (3) Within 15 days after service the respondent may refuse the admonition, reprimand, or censure and request a hearing before the commission. Such refusal and request will be in writing, addressed to the Grievance Committee, and served upon the secretary by certified mail, return receipt requested. The refusal will state that the admonition, reprimand, or censure is refused.

- (4) If a refusal and request are not served upon the secretary within 15 days after service upon the respondent of the admonition, reprimand, or censure, the admonition, reprimand, or censure will be deemed accepted by the respondent. An extension of time may be granted by the chair of the Grievance Committee for good cause shown. A censure that is deemed accepted by the respondent must be filed as provided by Rule .0127(a)(3) of this subchapter.
- (5) In cases in which the respondent refuses an admonition, reprimand, or censure, the counsel will prepare and file a complaint against the respondent at the commission.

(m) There shall be a grievance review panel of the Grievance Committee. For each review conducted, the chair shall appoint a panel consisting of the chair, two vice-chairs, and two other members of the Grievance Committee, including one public member. The panel shall not include any member who serves on the subcommittee that was assigned to address the underlying grievance file. The chair shall serve as the chair of the panel. If the chair or either of the two vice-chairs from the other subcommittees served on the subcommittee that issued the discipline or are otherwise unable to serve on the review panel, the chair may appoint a substitute member or members of the committee to serve on the review panel in the place of the chair or in the place of such vice-chair or vice-chairs.

(1) The panel shall have the following powers and duties:

(A) Upon a timely-filed written request by a grievance respondent, to review an order of public discipline issued to the respondent by the Grievance Committee.

(i) A written request for review must be filed with the secretary of the State Bar within 15 days of service of the public discipline upon the respondent.

(ii) The written request shall contain the grounds upon which the respondent believes review is warranted and may include supporting documentary evidence that has not previously been submitted to the Grievance Committee.

(iii) The respondent shall be entitled to be represented by legal counsel at the respondent's expense. The respondent or the respondent's legal counsel and legal counsel for the State Bar shall be entitled to appear and to present oral arguments to the panel. The panel's review shall be conducted upon the written record and oral arguments. Neither the respondent nor the State Bar may present live testimony or compel the production of books, papers, and other writings and documents in connection with a request for review. The panel may, in its discretion, question the respondent, legal counsel for the respondent, and legal counsel for the State Bar.

(iv) The panel shall consider the request for review, any documentation submitted in support of the request for review, and all materials that were before the Grievance Committee when it made its decision. The respondent shall be entitled to receive all material considered by the panel other than attorney-client privileged communications of the Office of Counsel and work product of the Office of Counsel. The panel shall determine whether the public discipline issued by the Grievance Committee is appropriate in light of all material considered by the panel.

(a) After considering the request for review, oral arguments, and the documentary record, the panel may, by majority vote, either concur in the public discipline issued by the Grievance Committee or remand the grievance file to the Grievance Committee with its recommendation for a different disposition.

(b) The panel shall prepare a memorandum communicating its determination to the respondent and to the Office of Counsel. The memorandum will not constitute an order and will not contain findings of fact, conclusions of law, or the rationale for the panel's determination.

(c) The Grievance Committee shall act upon a remand at its next regularly scheduled meeting.

(d) Upon remand, the Grievance Committee may affirm the public discipline that it issued or may reach a different disposition of the grievance file.

- (e) The decision of the Grievance Committee upon remand is final, and its decision is not subject to further consideration by the Grievance Committee.
 - (f) Within 15 days after service upon the respondent of (i) the panel's memorandum concurring in the original public discipline issued by the Grievance Committee, or (ii) the Grievance Committee's final decision upon remand after review, the respondent may refuse the public discipline imposed by the Grievance Committee and request a hearing before the commission. Such refusal and request shall be in writing, addressed to the Grievance Committee, and served upon the secretary of the State Bar by certified mail, return receipt requested.
 - (v) Second or subsequent requests for review of Grievance Committee action in the same file will not be considered.
 - (vi) A request for review is in addition to and not in derogation of all procedural and substantive rights contained in the Discipline and Disability Rules of the State Bar.
- (2) All proceedings and deliberations of the panel shall be conducted in a manner and at a time and location to be determined by the chair of the Grievance Committee. Reviews may be conducted by videoconference in the discretion of the chair.
 - (3) All proceedings of the panel are closed to the public. Neither the respondent nor legal counsel for the respondent and the State Bar shall be privy to deliberations of the panel. All documents, papers, letters, recordings, electronic records, or other documentary materials, regardless of physical form or characteristic, in the possession of the panel are confidential and are not public records within the meaning of Chapter 132 of the General Statutes.
- (n) Disciplinary Hearing Commission Complaints - Formal complaints will be issued in the name of the North Carolina State Bar as plaintiff and signed by the chair of the Grievance Committee. Amendments to complaints may be signed by the counsel alone, with the approval of the chair of the Grievance Committee.

*History Note: Authority G.S. 84-23; 84-28;
Readopted Eff. December 8, 1994;
Amendments Approved by the Supreme Court: March 3, 1999; February 3, 2000; October 8, 2009; March 27, 2019; September 25, 2020; March 19, 2025;
Amendments Approved by the Supreme Court October 18, 2023 and December 20, 2023 and re-entered into the Supreme Court's minutes March 20, 2024.*